

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
Technical Advisory Committee – Economic Development Subcommittee

Subject	Economic Development Subcommittee Meeting #4 Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Planning Framework	Date	June 2, 2021
Facilitator	Sara Dunnigan	Time	2:30pm – 4:00pm
Location	WebEx - https://governor.virginia.gov/i/gaand	Scribe	Emily Sokol

Invitees/Attendees			
#	Name	Organization/Role	Attended?
Economic Development Subcommittee Members and Staff Advisors			
1.	Sara Dunnigan – Chair	Deputy Director, GO Virginia and Economic Development, Department of Housing and Community Development	Y
2.	John Bateman – Vice Chair	Regional Planner, Northern Neck Planning District Commission	Y
3.	Katie Sallee – Staff	Confidential Assistant to the Secretary of Natural Resources	Y
4.	Jennifer Morgan	Economic Development Coordinator, George Washington Regional Commission	Y
5.	Dr. Troy Hartley	Director, Virginia Sea Grant	Y
6.	Robert W. Lazaro	Executive Director, Northern Virginia Regional Commission	Y
7.	Lewis L. Lawrence, III	Executive Director, Middle Peninsula Planning District Commission	Y
8.	Curtis Smith	Deputy Director, Middle Peninsula Planning District Commission	
9.	Stephen Moret	President & CEO, The Virginia Economic Development Partnership	Y
10.	Georgie Márquez	Principle, Andre Márquez Architects	Y
11.	Dr. Robert Weiss	Director, Center for Coastal Studies at Virginia Tech	
12.	Carol Considine	Institute for Coastal Adaptation and Resilience, Old Dominion University	Y
13.	Greg Grootendorst	Hampton Roads Planning District Commission	Y
14.	Todd Kilduff	Dewberry	Y
Scheduled Speakers			
15.	Kim McClellan	Public Policy Director, Fredericksburg Area Association of Realtors	Y
16.	Paul Robinson	Executive Director, RISE	Y
Designated Alternates			
Subcommittee Advisors			
17.	Emily Steinhilber	Coordinator, Commonwealth Center for Recurrent Flooding Resiliency at Old Dominion University	Y
Other Participants			
18.	Ann Phillips	Rear Admiral, US Navy (Ret.) – Special Assistant to the Governor for Coastal Adaptation and Protection	Y
19.	Connor Winstead	VA Dept. of Conservation & Recreation	Y
20.	Matt Dalon	VA Dept. of Conservation & Recreation	Y
21.	Tracy Munyan	Program Administrative Manager, Housing & Community Development	Y
22.	Lee Hutchinson		Y
23.	Keith Cannady		Y
24.	Michelle Rioux		Y
25.	Grace Tucker		Y
26.	Carol Considine		Y
27.	Sabine Rogers		Y
28.	Katerina Oskarsson		Y
29.	Margaret Rockwell		Y

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
Technical Advisory Committee – Economic Development Subcommittee

Invitees/Attendees			
#	Name	Organization/Role	Attended?
Consultant Support			
30.	Johanna Greenspan-Johnston	Dewberry	Y
31.	Emily Sokol	Vision Planning and Consulting	Y
32.	Dale Morris	The Water Institute of the Gulf	Y

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
1.	Roll Call and Quorum Affirmation	Sara Dunnigan called the meeting to order at 2:36 pm and took roll to establish a quorum. She advised that a quorum was present.
2.	Welcome and Chapter 1289 Reading	<p>John Bateman read the required Section 1289 verbiage and asked for a motion to continue the meeting virtually. Dr. Troy Hartley motioned, and Georgie Marquez seconded. Ms. Dunnigan conducted the vote, and the motion passed unanimously.</p> <p>Mr. Bateman advised all public attendees to insert questions in the chat box, which would be moderated by Katie Sallee throughout the meeting. If a disruption occurs, please contact Katie Sallee at katie.sallee@governor.virginia.gov or 804-663-7489.</p>
3.	Panel Discussion – <i>Resilience and Adaptation Economic Sector Opportunities</i>	<p>Ms. Dunnigan opened the floor to Dr. Hartley to introduce the panel speakers who were invited to present at the meeting. She stressed that the goal of these panels was to bring in individuals with different perspectives in the economic development realm and create a dialogue that could inform the Subcommittee’s primary effort of recommending a framework to align economic development goals with the priorities of the master plan.</p> <p>Dr. Hartley: Thank you for providing me with this opportunity. In the discussion of coastal flooding, it sometimes feels that there is a focus on how this issue limits economic development. However, it also has the potential to create other opportunities for development, especially since Virginia is one of the first states to focus extensively on promoting coastal resilience. We have three panelists scheduled to speak with the Subcommittee- two will present today and one will present at a future Subcommittee meeting.</p> <p>Dr. Hartley first introduced Kim McClellan, Public Policy Director of the Fredericksburg Area Association of Realtors, who also serves on the GO Virginia Region 6 Council and provides an exceptional perspective on the relevancy of coastal resilience in the real estate market. Ms. McClellan shared a presentation on the impacts of coastal flooding and coastal resiliency efforts on the housing economy, emphasizing the persistent demand for housing in coastal Virginia counties, the increase in housing market volatility caused by flooding, and the potential for adaptation and flood control technology to prevent property losses that would be detrimental to local communities and their economies (See Attached Slides).</p> <p>Emily Steinhilber (in chat): Not sure if this will go through but this is the report Kim mentioned from ODU - https://www.floodingresiliency.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/CCRFR-Housing-Studies-White-Paper-V4.pdf</p>

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
Technical Advisory Committee – Economic Development Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<p>Dr. Hartley thanked Ms. McClellan for her presentation and advised the Subcommittee members to hold their questions until the end of the presentations. He also emphasized to the Subcommittee that, while there is a focus on public investment opportunities, they should also be looking at opportunities for private investments in coastal resiliency efforts, as demonstrated by Ms. McClellan’s presentation. The implications of coastal flooding have resulted in losses for many counties, but this is a market opportunity that could help address the issue.</p> <p>Dr. Hartley then introduced Paul Robinson, Executive Director of the RISE program. Mr. Robinson thanked the Subcommittee for their time and emphasized his belief that the efforts of the RISE program could be extremely relevant to the goals of the Subcommittee in aligning economic development with coastal resiliency. His presentation provided a background on the program, its four-step RISE model, its current metrics, the five major resilience challenge topic areas it seeks to address, examples of the projects it is currently funding, and its goals for the future (See Attached Slides). Mr. Robinson accentuated that they have read the master plan and want to assist in any way possible, possibly by helping to develop some of the Subcommittee’s ideas. So, they want to be kept up to date on decisions made by the Subcommittee. Their goal is to develop jobs and grow small businesses while tackling resiliency efforts.</p> <p>Dr. Hartley thanked Paul for his presentation and emphasized how exciting it is to hear about the number of small businesses they have been able to fund in the coastal resiliency field. Ms. Dunnigan then opened the floor to Subcommittee members for questions or observations.</p> <p>Discussion Point- Lewis Lawrence: Both presentations were spot on. We have been working with Paul for a long time and recognize the importance of pushing out these smaller projects that can have an impact on the overall coastal resiliency effort and be given an arena to grow. And Kim is right- if we do not find a way to protect the shoreline, there will be huge losses and we will not be able to protect the tax base.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms. McClellan: It is a push and pull between the concern of not having enough housing and creating housing opportunities that are potentially vulnerable to flooding hazards. How do we rectify this? I think technology, such as that provided by the projects that Paul’s program funds, is key to the efforts moving forward. - Ms. Dunnigan: I think the projects that GO Virginia is funding demonstrate how economic development can capitalize on the issue of coastal flooding by nurturing and growing high-growth potential companies while also solving problems. We also have not yet touched on infrastructure technology and newly developed building materials that can be implemented in new housing construction. It is compelling to have these funding sources that can draw in small businesses and demonstrate viable opportunities to localities, who are often motivated by job creation and retention. These examples spotlight opportunities that Virginia has created to build in this space. <p>Discussion Point- Ms. Dunnigan: I have a question for Paul. What motivates a company in an economic development space to align its goals with the master plan?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr. Robinson: They are motivated by the assistance we give them and the opportunity to demonstrate their success in a full-scale environment. It does not

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
Technical Advisory Committee – Economic Development Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<p>hurt that there is funding associated, but these are only partial grants. Part of the funding is in the form of loans that are repaid to us out of their revenue. Even so, these companies are coming from all around the world to work with this program. They are motivated by their opportunity to grow. Does that answer your question?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms. Dunnigan: Not exactly. You said that you wanted to align the interests of the RISE program and the companies it is funding with the goals of the master plan as it is being developed. Can you explain a little more about this and what you envision? - Mr. Robinson: The master plan has several areas of interest that drew our attention, such as nature-based solutions. That in and of itself is helpful, but we have to be aware that these solutions must be adapted to fit the localities and communities' needs. The goal is to help communities adapt to flooding directly. <p>Discussion Point- Georgie Márquez: Paul, you discussed on the metrics slide that your program has funded 27 businesses and has provided training as well. Are any of your programs' efforts associated with workforce development? If so, are there specific demographics you are targeting with such efforts?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr. Robinson: We have a few workplace development projects that we are funding, such as a Wetlands Watch green infrastructure design training for professionals. I cannot provide details about the demographics of those being trained for this project, but they mostly include professionals in the landscaping business, business owners, and contractors. Another company is conducting a home-raising academy, training teams to raise homes efficiently and cost-effectively. Participating teams are mainly led by contractors who want to expand into this field. In coordination with workforce development, we partnered with the New Profit foundation and the local workforce development board to bring three companies down to re-skill low-trained workers and promote their return to the workforce, as many of them lost positions during COVID. We are trying to help support that effort. You might ask what this has to do with coastal resilience. Economic resilience has a huge impact on the success of the whole community, and most of the jobs that were lost during the COVID crisis were concentrated in the population of individuals earning less than \$40,000 per year. Bringing them back into the workforce is a vital part of supporting the community's overall economic resilience and ability to address issues related to coastal flooding. - Dr. Hartley: In discussing workforce development efforts, we have to recognize that we are all growing the innovation ecosystem organically by investing in these efforts. Understanding where this market is and how solutions can be generated and grown can put Virginia in a good position to sell these solutions in the future, as other states begin to put more focus on promoting coastal resilience. Another exciting prospect associated with GO Virginia is the expansion of the living laboratory and its capacity. - Mr. Robinson: The master plan provides a huge market opportunity that can attract companies from all over the world to Virginia to spend their resources and develop their products and solutions. <p>Discussion Point- Mr. Lawrence: The problem is that, in the economic development space for coastal resilience, if a company cannot get a permit from VMRC for these projects, it cannot grow. We need to spend some time looking at the regulatory framework- the ease</p>

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
Technical Advisory Committee – Economic Development Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<p>or difficulty with which these companies can secure permits and the forms of red tape they will face on the road to implementation.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dr. Hartley: I agree, this demonstrates an opportunity as a Subcommittee to think through potential recommendations. One possibility could be, if we have available experimental locations, we could have a system for getting an experimental permit for working in these living laboratories. Success in this realm could lead to a streamlined process to securing more official permits. - Ms. Dunnigan: Yes, and there could possibly be a fast track for companies that have self-identified with specific goals and priorities of the master plan. - Mr. Robinson: We find, in our local area, that we can play an important role in making the process easier for companies, but at some point, it is up to local communities and cities to work to keep the companies in the area. We can only introduce and provide an arena for the companies to grow- retaining the companies requires attention from local economic development authorities. - Ms. Dunnigan: That is a great point. In our efforts to incubate these companies, there needs to be a set process for passing the baton off to the local economic developers as the companies grow. These are great ideas, and I am curious about VEDP's perspective, as well as the economic development community's perspective at large, who are generally focused on attraction and retention of these companies. We have to recognize the opportunity for future growth through investment in small businesses, rather than simply focusing on attracting large businesses. Thank you to both of our presenters. We have additionally been discussing housing construction and innovative materials that can be used in coastal areas to build resilient homes, while balancing this effort with the reality that there needs to be a dry piece of ground on which to build, emphasizing the importance of maintaining shorelines. - Dale Morris (in chat): Great suggestion for RISE to maybe also score proposals on whether they are responding to specific components of, or "in alignment with," goals of the VA CRMP.
4.	Overview of Survey Dissemination and Responses	<p>Ms. Dunnigan then transitioned to provide an update on the dissemination of the survey developed by the Subcommittee. The purpose of the survey is to establish a "baseline" of understanding and awareness of the master plan among the Subcommittee's contacts. Additionally, the survey offers space for self-reflection, letting contacts explain the degree to which their economic development initiatives are aligned with the goals of the master plan. Ms. Dunnigan reported that, as of last week, the survey had fifteen responses, and she did not believe there had been additional submissions since last week. Ms. Dunnigan advised the Subcommittee that she would be forwarding the survey to some state agency contacts, as well as the GO Virginia regions within the study area (Regions 4, 5, and 6). Additionally, she stated that Mr. Bateman would be forwarding the survey to his PDC contacts. Ms. Dunnigan asked the Subcommittee if there were any questions or comments regarding current survey activity, as well as any suggestions on how to increase the number of responses to the survey.</p> <p>Discussion Point- Mr. Bateman: We have not received any responses from Hampton Roads or Northern Virginia, but I would really like to get some participation from those regions.</p>

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
Technical Advisory Committee – Economic Development Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Greg Grootendorst: If you could send me the list of individuals or organizations that have already responded to the survey, I would be happy to send out a reminder. I just want to ensure that I am not sending out the survey to anyone who has already completed it. - Mr. Bateman: Yes, we can forward you that information. - Jennifer Morgan: I included all of my CAO contacts and economic developers for region 6 on the list of those that were originally sent the survey. However, I do not have a link to the survey itself or a way to forward it. All of the Subcommittee members should be given the link so that we can pass it on to our networks. - Mr. Grootendorst: I have not received a link for the survey either. - Ms. Dunnigan: That was an oversight on our part. I will send you all the link, and we will work with Katie and staff to compile a list of those who have already responded to the survey. That way, you can forward the survey link to your networks. <p>Ms. Dunnigan recommended that time be allocated in the next Subcommittee meeting for the review of survey responses and the development of the framework or set of recommendations for aligning economic development efforts with the goals of the master plan. By having a clear awareness of the goals and priorities of the master plan and coordinating this with information provided by the Project ID Subcommittee, we will have actionable areas to address through our recommendations. We want to make sure there is a robust communication mechanism between the Project ID Subcommittee and economic developers, so that they can benefit from these opportunities.</p>
5.	Timeline and Next Steps	<p>Ms. Dunnigan stated that a timeline had been established for the survey, and that the Subcommittee is looking forward to receiving more responses to help guide their efforts. She emphasized how beneficial the panel discussion at the beginning of the Subcommittee meeting was and asked the Subcommittee to consider what other perspectives could be brought to the table for presentations in future Subcommittee meetings.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dr. Hartley: I have already reached out to a contact in the venture capital space, as that is where some of the big money for funding lies currently. This is just a musing, but I would be interested to hear from organizations and systems currently in place in the State that promote economic development. It would be nice to hear about policy objectives that other states may have employed in the economic development system or any stories from economic developers that can offer solutions for aligning interests. - Ms. Márquez: I do not know if this is possible, though virtual meetings may make it more possible than in the past, but is there any way to get representatives from other states, such as Louisiana, who can provide stories about what has worked and not worked for them in the economic development realm? Would that be considered appropriate? - Ms. Dunnigan: I think that is a great idea. Rear Admiral Ann Phillips had to leave the meeting, but she has said in the past that she has contacts either in Louisiana or Florida who have gone down this path, so I can follow up with her about making those connections. - Ms. Steinhilber (in chat): I'm happy to help as well with EDF partners in Louisiana.

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
Technical Advisory Committee – Economic Development Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dale Morris: I can try to engage some of my contacts in the Gulf and those at Louisiana Economic Development. To provide some context, McKinsey completed a report in 2012 that identified economic development opportunities and the intersection with upcoming technology that could be used as an advantage. One major takeaway from the experience in Louisiana is that it is easier to align economic development with coastal resiliency efforts when there is a lot of federal funding being poured into the state as a result of natural disasters. It is good to look at Louisiana’s process because they have had pulses of federal investment that tend to be reactionary, so there could be things to learn as well as things we may want to avoid. - Ms. Dunnigan: Yes, sustained funding in this space is extremely important. We should also be thinking about federal funding that will be coming in for coastal resiliency efforts and how the master plan could provide insight for the use of these funds. - Mr. Morris: Finding these federal funding sources for proactive coastal resiliency efforts is a high priority. To use Louisiana as another example, prior to Katrina the State was spending about \$150 million a year, but post-Katrina they now spend about \$1 billion a year on coastal resilience projects. The state has determined to focus the spending of their revenue on carrying out their coastal master plan. - Mr. Lawrence: Virginia has been the recipient of pulse funding from non-FEMA federal sources. The problem is that most of the communities included in the list to receive this funding are either not aware of it or do not know what to do with it. Even though we have these available funding streams, the localities need to know how to use the money for coastal resilience efforts, how to funnel it to private sources, and what requirements they must meet to receive funding. This is a very complex issue, so one goal for our Subcommittee could be to come up with a framework for this process. - Dr. Hartley: Maybe we could look at the Blue Economy effort in Boston. I suspect Mr. Robinson may know more about this. It could provide some suggestions about how to make investments throughout the innovation ecosystem, how to identify current gaps in funding, and what funding sources could be available. - Mr. Bateman: I think that is why the GO Virginia projects in regions 5 and 6 are so intriguing. Echoing Mr. Lawrence, the impulse to be reactive is very strong in this space, so we have to fight that urge. It is important to exist in the pre-planning space to see where it can grow. - Mr. Morris (in chat): Planning capacity building is essential too. - Ms. Steinhilber (in chat): There are a few other cities with non-disaster-based approaches to water-based economies- e.g., Minneapolis; clearly different than both NO and VA, but worth noting. - Ms. Dunnigan: I agree, I think it would be beneficial to incorporate these perspectives from other states. - Mr. Morris: Keep in mind, Minneapolis is focused on water quality, but it might be beneficial to look at their framework, considering their success. - Ms. Dunnigan: Maybe we could bring in a panel of traditional economic developers from Virginia to better understand how they view intermittent flooding’s impact on their ability to succeed, as well as how they incorporate resiliency in their development efforts and if they are viewing coastal flooding as a problem or an opportunity. I am sure they are primarily concerned about new job

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
Technical Advisory Committee – Economic Development Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<p>creation and expanding their tax base but getting their perspective would provide us some insight.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr. Lawrence: That is assuming that the economic developers are actively thinking about coastal flooding and the problems it poses. We could also reach out to business owners to talk about potential opportunities. <p>Ms. Dunnigan: That is a great idea. We are going to work to boost survey responses and organize panels for future meetings. Mr. Bateman and I will work with Rear Admiral Phillips to develop a timeline for delivering the framework. In doing so, we will begin to frame the framework and get questions answered that will be helpful for our contribution to the master plan. I really appreciate the idea of promoting transparency about available resources. Many entrepreneurs are unaware of the resources available to them, so increasing awareness of these opportunities could be a productive way of improving alignment.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms. Morgan: If the entrepreneurs that we identify could be around the industry clusters of each of our regions, it would increase the number of companies available for outreach.
6.	Public Comment Period	Ms. Sallee advised the Subcommittee that no public comments were submitted throughout the course of the meeting, and no one had registered for public comment.
7.	Wrap-Up and Adjourn	<p>Ms. Dunnigan asked the Subcommittee if anyone wanted to promote an upcoming event. Ms. Morgan said that she would be speaking at a webinar hosted by Resilient Virginia on June 17th. Ms. Steinhilber recognized Annette Osso from Resilient Virginia as a potential contact, and Ms. Dunnigan asked for her contact information to reach out and potentially add her as a Subcommittee advisor. Ms. Dunnigan also asked Ms. Morgan to forward information about the webinar event so that she could circulate it to the Subcommittee. Ms. Dunnigan also notified the Subcommittee that a new advisor from VDOT would be joining discussions at the next meeting.</p> <p>Ms. Dunnigan asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Márquez moved, and Mr. Lawrence seconded. Ms. Dunnigan conducted the verbal vote, and the motion passed unanimously. Ms. Dunnigan adjourned the meeting at 4:05 pm.</p>

Action Items			
#	Action Item	Owner (Organization)	Due Date
1.	Provide the link to the economic development survey, as well as a list of those who have already responded to the survey, to all Subcommittee members.	Subcommittee Chairs/Staff	ASAP
2.	Forward economic development survey link to all relevant contacts so that responses can be reviewed at the next Subcommittee meeting.	All	6/28

If you have any questions, please contact Emily Sokol, Vision Planning and Consulting, at esokol@vision-pc.net.